

Polymorphic automorphisms and the Picard group

Jason Parker

(joint with Pieter Hofstra and Philip Scott, University of Ottawa)

Brandon University, Manitoba, Canada

Logic Supergroup Early Career Researcher Conference
October 14, 2021

Introduction

- The notion of *definable automorphism* occurs throughout algebra, model theory, and computer science.
- In first-order logic, an automorphism α of a model M of a first-order theory is *definable* if there is a formula $\varphi(x, y)$ such that $\alpha(a) = b$ iff $M \models \varphi(a, b)$ for all $a, b \in M$. E.g. if G is a group, then the inner automorphism induced by $g \in G$ is definable by the formula $y = gxg^{-1}$.
- Definable automorphisms are *polymorphic* or *uniform*, and can provide a generalized notion of *inner automorphism*.

Motivation

- To motivate this, we recall that George Bergman proved in [1] that the definable group automorphisms, i.e. the inner automorphisms given by conjugation, can be characterized purely *categorically* as the automorphisms that extend naturally along any group homomorphism.
- To see this, observe first that if α is an inner automorphism of a group G (induced by $s \in G$), then for each group morphism $f : G \rightarrow H$ with domain G we can ‘push forward’ α to define an inner automorphism

$$\alpha_f : H \xrightarrow{\sim} H$$

by conjugation with $f(s) \in H$ (so that $\alpha_{\text{id}_G} = \alpha$).

Motivation

- This family of automorphisms $(\alpha_f)_f$ is *coherent*, in the sense that it satisfies the following *naturality* property: if $f : G \rightarrow G'$ and $f' : G' \rightarrow G''$ are group homomorphisms, then the following diagram commutes:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} G' & \xrightarrow{\alpha_f} & G' \\ f' \downarrow & & \downarrow f' \\ G'' & \xrightarrow{\alpha_{f' \circ f}} & G'' \end{array}$$

Bergman's theorem

For a group G , let us call an *arbitrary* family of automorphisms

$$\left(\alpha_f : \mathbf{cod}(f) \xrightarrow{\sim} \mathbf{cod}(f) \right)_{\mathbf{dom}(f)=G}$$

with the above naturality property an *extended inner automorphism* of G .

Theorem (Bergman [1])

Let G be a group and $\alpha : G \xrightarrow{\sim} G$ an automorphism of G . Then α is an **inner** automorphism of G iff there is an extended inner automorphism $(\alpha_f)_f$ of G with $\alpha = \alpha_{\mathbf{id}_G}$.

This provides a completely *categorical* characterization of inner automorphisms of groups: they are exactly those group automorphisms that are 'coherently extendible' along morphisms out of their domain.

Covariant isotropy

- We have a functor $\mathcal{Z} : \mathbf{Group} \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$ that sends any group G to its group of extended inner automorphisms $\mathcal{Z}(G)$. We refer to \mathcal{Z} as the *covariant isotropy group (functor)* of the category \mathbf{Group} . (Bergman's theorem actually entails that $\mathcal{Z} \cong \text{Id} : \mathbf{Group} \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$.)
- In fact, *any* category \mathbb{C} has a *covariant isotropy group (functor)*

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{C}} : \mathbb{C} \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$$

that sends each object $C \in \mathbb{C}$ to the group of extended inner automorphisms of C , i.e. families of automorphisms

$$\left(\alpha_f : \mathbf{cod}(f) \xrightarrow{\sim} \mathbf{cod}(f) \right)_{\mathbf{dom}(f)=C}$$

in \mathbb{C} with the same naturality property as before, i.e. natural automorphisms of the projection functor $C/\mathbb{C} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$.

Covariant isotropy

- We can also turn Bergman's characterization of inner automorphisms in **Group** into a *definition* of inner automorphisms in an arbitrary category \mathbb{C} : if $C \in \mathbb{C}$, we say that an automorphism $\alpha : C \xrightarrow{\sim} C$ is *inner* if there is an extended inner automorphism $(\alpha_f)_f \in \mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{C}}(C)$ with $\alpha \text{id}_C = \alpha$.
- Notice that **Group** is the category of (set-based) *models* of an *algebraic theory*, i.e. a set of equational axioms between terms, namely the theory \mathbb{T}_{Grp} of groups. So **Group** = $\mathbb{T}_{\text{Grp}}\mathbf{mod}$.
- We will generalize ideas from the proof of Bergman's Theorem to give a 'syntactic' characterization of the (extended) inner automorphisms of $\mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$, i.e. of the covariant isotropy group of $\mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$, for any so-called *quasi-equational* theory \mathbb{T} .

Covariant isotropy

- We will then use this result to characterize the covariant isotropy groups of the category **StrMonCat** of strict monoidal categories and any presheaf category **Set** ^{\mathcal{J}} .
- In particular, we will show that the covariant isotropy group of **StrMonCat** sends any strict monoidal category to its *Picard group*, i.e. its group of \otimes -invertible objects.

Quasi-equational theories

- What is a quasi-equational theory? (Also known as: partial Horn theory, essentially algebraic theory, cartesian theory, finite limit theory.)
- First, we need the notion of a *signature* Σ , which consists of a non-empty set Σ_{Sort} of *sorts*, and a set Σ_{Fun} of (typed) *function/operation symbols*.
- For example, the signature for *groups* has one sort X and three function symbols $\cdot : X \times X \rightarrow X$, $^{-1} : X \rightarrow X$, and $e : X$. The signature for *categories* has two sorts O, A and four function symbols **dom**, **cod** : $A \rightarrow O$, **id** : $O \rightarrow A$, and $\circ : A \times A \rightarrow A$.

Quasi-equational theories

- We can then form the set **Term**(Σ) of *terms* over Σ , constructed from variables and function symbols, as well as the set **Horn**(Σ) of *Horn formulas* over Σ , which are finite conjunctions of equations between terms.
- A *quasi-equational theory* over a signature Σ is then a set of *implications* (the *axioms* of \mathbb{T}) of the form $\varphi \Rightarrow \psi$, with $\varphi, \psi \in \mathbf{Horn}(\Sigma)$ (see [7]).
- The operation symbols of a quasi-equational theory are only required to be *partially* defined. If t is a term, we write $t \downarrow$ as an abbreviation for $t = t$, meaning ‘ t is defined’.

Examples

- Any *algebraic* theory, whose axioms all have the form $\top \Rightarrow \psi$, where \top is the empty conjunction. E.g. the theories of sets, semigroups, (commutative) monoids, (abelian) groups, (commutative) rings with unit, etc.
- The theories of categories and groupoids. E.g. two of the axioms of the theory of categories are

$$g \circ f \downarrow \Rightarrow \mathbf{dom}(g) = \mathbf{cod}(f),$$

$$\mathbf{dom}(g) = \mathbf{cod}(f) \Rightarrow g \circ f \downarrow.$$

- The theory of strict monoidal categories, and the theory of presheaves $\mathcal{J} \rightarrow \mathbf{Set}$ on a small category \mathcal{J} .

Proof of Bergman's theorem

- To motivate our characterization of covariant isotropy for categories of models of quasi-equational theories, let us review a specific idea in the proof of Bergman's Theorem.
- Consider the group $G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$ obtained from a group G by freely adjoining an indeterminate element \mathbf{x} . Elements of $G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$ are (reduced) group words in \mathbf{x} and elements of G .
- The underlying set of $G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$ can be endowed with a *substitution monoid* structure: given $w_1, w_2 \in G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$, we set $w_1 \cdot w_2$ to be the reduction of $w_1[w_2/\mathbf{x}]$, and the unit is \mathbf{x} itself.
- If $w \in G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$, w commutes generically with the group operations if:
 - ▶ In $G\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{x}_2 \rangle$, the reduction of $w[\mathbf{x}_1/\mathbf{x}]w[\mathbf{x}_2/\mathbf{x}]$ is $w[\mathbf{x}_1\mathbf{x}_2/\mathbf{x}]$;
 - ▶ In $G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$, the reduction of w^{-1} is $w[\mathbf{x}^{-1}/\mathbf{x}]$;
 - ▶ In $G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$, the reduction of $w[e/\mathbf{x}]$ in $G\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle$ is e .

Proof of Bergman's theorem

- E.g. if $g \in G$, then the word $g\mathbf{x}g^{-1} \in G\langle\mathbf{x}\rangle$ commutes generically with the group operations:
 - ▶ $g\mathbf{x}_1g^{-1}g\mathbf{x}_2g^{-1} \sim g\mathbf{x}_1\mathbf{x}_2g^{-1}$
 - ▶ $(g\mathbf{x}g^{-1})^{-1} \sim (g^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{x}^{-1}g^{-1} \sim g\mathbf{x}^{-1}g^{-1}$,
 - ▶ $geg^{-1} \sim gg^{-1} \sim e$.
- Let $\mathbf{Inv}(G\langle\mathbf{x}\rangle)$ be the subgroup of *invertible* elements of the substitution monoid $G\langle\mathbf{x}\rangle$. (E.g. $g\mathbf{x}g^{-1}$ is invertible, with inverse $g^{-1}\mathbf{x}g$.)
- Then the proof of Bergman's Theorem shows that the group $\mathcal{Z}(G)$ is isomorphic to the subgroup of $\mathbf{Inv}(G\langle\mathbf{x}\rangle)$ consisting of all words that commute generically with the group operations.

The isotropy group of a quasi-equational theory

- Fix a quasi-equational theory \mathbb{T} over a signature Σ , and let $\mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$ be the category of (set-based) models of \mathbb{T} .
- We will now give a *logical/syntactic* characterization of the covariant isotropy group

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}} : \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod} \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$$

of $\mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$.

- Using the quasi-equational syntax of \mathbb{T} , we can define a notion of *definable automorphism* for a model M of \mathbb{T} , and the definable automorphisms of any $M \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$ form a group $\mathbf{DefInn}(M)$.

Definable automorphisms

- Given $M \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$ and $A \in \Sigma_{\mathbf{Sort}}$, one can form the \mathbb{T} -model $M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle$ obtained from M by freely adjoining an indeterminate element \mathbf{x}_A of sort A . For any sort B , elements of $M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_B$ are congruence classes $[t]$ of Σ -terms t of sort B involving \mathbf{x}_A and constants from M , where two such terms s, t are congruent if they are provably equal in the *diagram theory* $\mathbb{T}(M, \mathbf{x}_A)$ of M extended by the axiom $\top \vdash \mathbf{x}_A \downarrow$.
- For any sort A , the set $M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_A$ is a monoid under substitution: the unit is $[\mathbf{x}_A]$ and $[s] \cdot [t] = [s[t/\mathbf{x}_A]]$ for $[s], [t] \in M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_A$. We then have the product monoid $\prod_A M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_A$.

Definable automorphisms

- So an element $([s_A])_A \in \prod_A M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_A$ is (*substitutionally*) *invertible* if for each sort A , there is some $[s_A^{-1}] \in M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_A$ with

$$\mathbb{T}(M, \mathbf{x}_A) \vdash s_A [s_A^{-1} / \mathbf{x}_A] = \mathbf{x}_A = s_A^{-1} [s_A / \mathbf{x}_A].$$

- If $f : A_1 \times \dots \times A_n \rightarrow A$ is an operation symbol of Σ , then $([s_A])_A \in \prod_A M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_A$ *commutes generically with* f if $\mathbb{T}(M, \mathbf{x}_{A_1}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{A_n})$ proves the sequent

$$f(\mathbf{x}_{A_1}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{A_n}) \downarrow \vdash s_A [f(\mathbf{x}_{A_1}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{A_n}) / \mathbf{x}_A] = f(s_{A_1}, \dots, s_{A_n}),$$

and *reflects definedness of* f if $\mathbb{T}(M, \mathbf{x}_{A_1}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{A_n})$ proves the sequent

$$s_A [f(\mathbf{x}_{A_1}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{A_n}) / \mathbf{x}_A] \downarrow \vdash f(\mathbf{x}_{A_1}, \dots, \mathbf{x}_{A_n}) \downarrow.$$

Definable automorphisms

We define $\mathbf{DefInn}(M)$ to be the subgroup of the product monoid $\prod_A M\langle \mathbf{x}_A \rangle_A$ consisting of the invertible elements that commute generically with and reflect definedness of every $f \in \Sigma_{\mathbf{Fun}}$.

Theorem ([4])

Let \mathbb{T} be a quasi-equational theory. For any $M \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$, the covariant isotropy group $\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(M)$, i.e. the group of extended inner automorphisms of M , is isomorphic to the group $\mathbf{DefInn}(M)$ of definable automorphisms of M .

In particular, an automorphism $\alpha : M \xrightarrow{\sim} M$ in $\mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$ is *inner* iff there is some $([s_A])_A \in \mathbf{DefInn}(M)$ that *induces* α , i.e. for each sort A

$$(m \in M_A) \quad \alpha_A(m) = s_A [m/\mathbf{x}_A]^M \in M_A.$$

Initial examples ([3])

- If \mathbb{T} is the theory of sets, then \mathbb{T} has trivial isotropy group, i.e. $\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(S) \cong \mathbf{DefInn}(S) \cong \{[\mathbf{x}]\}$ for any set S , so the only inner automorphism of a set is the *identity* function.
- If \mathbb{T} is the theory of groups, then Bergman proved $\forall G \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod} = \mathbf{Group}$ that

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(G) \cong \mathbf{DefInn}(G) \cong \{[g\mathbf{x}g^{-1}] \in G\langle\mathbf{x}\rangle \mid g \in G\} \cong G.$$

- If \mathbb{T} is the theory of monoids, then $\forall M \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod} = \mathbf{Mon}$ we have

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(M) \cong \mathbf{DefInn}(M) \cong \{[m\mathbf{x}m^{-1}] \in M\langle\mathbf{x}\rangle \mid m \in \mathbf{Inv}(M)\} \cong \mathbf{Inv}(M).$$

Initial examples ([3])

- If \mathbb{T} is the theory of abelian groups, then $\forall G \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod} = \mathbf{Ab}$ we have

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(G) \cong \mathbf{DefInn}(G) \cong \{[\mathbf{x}], [-\mathbf{x}]\} \cong \mathbb{Z}_2.$$

- If \mathbb{T} is the theory of commutative monoids or unital rings, then \mathbb{T} has trivial isotropy group.
- If \mathbb{T} is the theory of (not necessarily commutative) unital rings, then $\forall R \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod} = \mathbf{Ring}$ we have

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(R) \cong \mathbf{DefInn}(R) \cong \{[rxr^{-1}] \in R\langle \mathbf{x} \rangle \mid r \in \mathbf{Unit}(R)\} \cong \mathbf{Unit}(R).$$

- If \mathbb{T} is the theory of categories or groupoids, then \mathbb{T} has trivial isotropy group.

Strict monoidal categories

- If \mathbb{T} is the quasi-equational theory of strict monoidal categories, then we proved in [4] that for any strict monoidal category \mathbb{C} , the group **Deflnn**(\mathbb{C}) consists (up to isomorphism) of exactly the monoidal *inner* automorphisms, i.e. the automorphisms $F : \mathbb{C} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ for which there is some \otimes -invertible object $c \in \mathbb{C}$ such that F is given by *conjugation* with c , i.e.

$$(a \in \mathbb{C}) \qquad F(a) = c \otimes a \otimes c^{-1}.$$

- We then deduced that

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(\mathbb{C}) \cong \mathbf{Deflnn}(\mathbb{C}) \cong \mathbf{Inv}(\mathbf{Ob}(\mathbb{C})),$$

the group of \otimes -invertible elements of the object monoid of \mathbb{C} , also known as the *Picard group* of \mathbb{C} .

Presheaf categories

- We can also characterize the covariant isotropy group of a *presheaf category* $\mathbf{Set}^{\mathcal{J}}$ for a small category \mathcal{J} .
- Given a small category \mathcal{J} , we can define a quasi-equational theory $\mathbb{T}^{\mathcal{J}}$ whose models are functors $\mathcal{J} \rightarrow \mathbf{Set}$, i.e.

$$\mathbb{T}^{\mathcal{J}} \mathbf{mod} \cong \mathbf{Set}^{\mathcal{J}}.$$

- The sorts are the objects of \mathcal{J} , for any morphism $f : i \rightarrow j$ one introduces a unary operation symbol $\hat{f} : i \rightarrow j$, and one has axioms expressing functoriality.

Presheaf categories

- If $F : \mathcal{J} \rightarrow \mathbf{Set}$ is a presheaf, we showed in [4] that $\mathbf{DefInn}(F)$ consists (up to isomorphism) of exactly the natural automorphisms $\alpha : F \xrightarrow{\sim} F$ induced by some element $\psi \in \mathbf{Aut}(\mathrm{Id}_{\mathcal{J}})$, in the sense that

$$(k \in \mathcal{J}) \quad \alpha_k = F(\psi_k) : F(k) \xrightarrow{\sim} F(k).$$

- It then follows that the covariant isotropy group $\mathcal{Z} : \mathbf{Set}^{\mathcal{J}} \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$ is *constant* on the group $\mathbf{Aut}(\mathrm{Id}_{\mathcal{J}})$ of natural automorphisms of $\mathrm{Id}_{\mathcal{J}} : \mathcal{J} \rightarrow \mathcal{J}$.

Presheaf categories

- if \mathcal{J} is a *rigid* category (i.e. has no non-trivial automorphisms), then the covariant isotropy group $\mathcal{Z} : \mathbf{Set}^{\mathcal{J}} \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$ is constant on the trivial group.
- For any group G , the covariant isotropy group $\mathcal{Z} : \mathbf{Set}^G \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$ of the category of G -sets is constant on the centre $Z(G)$ of the group G .
- More generally, for any monoid M , the covariant isotropy group $\mathcal{Z} : \mathbf{Set}^M \rightarrow \mathbf{Group}$ of the category of M -sets is constant on the group $\mathbf{Inv}(Z(M))$ of invertible elements of the centre of M .

Connections with topos theory

- If \mathbb{T} is a quasi-equational theory, then \mathbb{T} has a *classifying topos* $\mathcal{B}(\mathbb{T})$, which is a cocomplete topos that has a *universal model* of \mathbb{T} and classifies all topos-theoretic models of \mathbb{T} ([5], [6]).
- It has been shown that any Grothendieck topos \mathcal{E} has a canonical internal group object called the *isotropy group* of the topos, which acts canonically on every object of the topos and formally generalizes the notion of conjugation ([2]).
- The covariant isotropy group $\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}$ of a quasi-equational theory \mathbb{T} is in fact the isotropy group object of the classifying topos $\mathcal{B}(\mathbb{T})$ of \mathbb{T} ([2], [5]).

Conclusions

- Bergman's *element-free* characterization of the inner automorphisms of groups can be used to *define* inner automorphisms in arbitrary categories.
- We have extended Bergman's *logical* characterization of the (extended) inner automorphisms of groups, i.e. of the covariant isotropy group of $\mathbf{Group} = \mathbb{T}_{\mathbf{Grp}}\mathbf{mod}$, to the covariant isotropy group of $\mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$ for *any* quasi-equational theory \mathbb{T} : we have $\mathcal{Z}_{\mathbb{T}}(M) \cong \mathbf{DefInn}(M)$ for any $M \in \mathbb{T}\mathbf{mod}$.
- Using this characterization, we have obtained logical descriptions of the definable and (extended) inner automorphisms in $\mathbf{StrMonCat}$ and presheaf categories (among other algebraic categories).

Thank you!

References I

- [1] G. Bergman. An inner automorphism is only an inner automorphism, but an inner endomorphism can be something strange. *Publicacions Matematiques* 56, 91-126, 2012.
- [2] J. Funk, P. Hofstra, B. Steinberg. Isotropy and crossed toposes. *Theory and Applications of Categories* 26, 660-709, 2012.
- [3] P. Hofstra, J. Parker, P. Scott. Isotropy of algebraic theories. *Electronic Notes in Theoretical Computer Science* 341: 201-217, 2018.
- [4] P. Hofstra, J. Parker, P. Scott. Polymorphic automorphisms and the Picard group. 6th International Conference on Formal Structures for Computation and Deduction (FSCD 2021), N. Koyayashi, Ed. Dagstuhl Publications LIPIcs, Vol. 195, FSCD 2021.
- [5] P. T. Johnstone. *Sketches of an Elephant: A Topos Theory Compendium*. Clarendon Press, 2002.

References II

- [6] S. Mac Lane, I. Moerdijk. *Sheaves in Geometry and Logic: A First Introduction to Topos Theory*. Springer-Verlag, 1992.
- [7] E. Palmgren, S.J. Vickers. Partial Horn logic and cartesian categories. *Annals of Pure and Applied Logic* 145, 314-353, 2007.